

CLIMATE LEADERSHIP ACADEMY

Promising Practices in Green Job Creation

Summary Report – July 1, 2010

MONDAY, MAY 24, 2010 | OPENING DAY

Theme: Framing The Challenge

Remarks: Ben Hecht, President & CEO, Living Cities

- How do we take on the problems facing cities today in new and different ways? Last year the Green Boot Camp on Building Energy Retrofitting at Harvard University focused on the \$40B from the Recovery Act. Cities, states, workforce investment boards, housing authorities, quasi-governmental entities were catalyzed to build a system and work together to survive this infusion of dollars.
- We are at a particularly critical period of time. Business is facing a strategic inflection point, which essentially is a point where the old systems must change to adapt to the new reality. Cities are at the cornerstone of the new green economic reality.

Keynote Address: “Making the Green Economy a Reality”, Van Jones, Senior Fellow, Center for American Progress and author of *The Green Collar Economy*

- When green jobs first came about the emphasis was on “green,” now the emphasis is on “jobs.”
- “What you’re engaged in now is bigger than the green economy.... What you’re really doing is laying the cornerstone for the next American economy.”
- There are three fallacies of the last American economy. The first false assumption is that we would be able to consume our way to prosperity. The second false assumption is that we could have an economy based on credit and debt rather than smart savings and thrift. The third false assumption is that we could go on forever basing our economy on ecological destruction, rather than ecological stewardship and restoration. In the next American economy, the emphasis will be on building rather than borrowing, conserving rather than wasting, and respecting the earth rather than destroying it.

- The environmental message has previously been that everyone was doing something wrong and that people needed to spend more money to correct it. You can now be a part of the conversation and change the message to convey that cities want to help people save money and earn money. That is a very different starting point and message for green politics and the green economy.
- Previous assumptions about environmentalists are that they are really rich, really weird, or really liberal. But energy efficiency is about the most conservative thing you can do. If you finance it the right way, the resulting savings will pay for the project, itself.
- Given the stresses cities are going to be facing, being able to demonstrate the savings of a particular project will reap benefits. Cities are going to be getting less prosperous and more diverse. Common ground and model projects are needed. Issues such as clean air, saving resources, and preserving the environment are common ground. "You're not talking about increasing welfare; you're talking about increasing work. [You're] not increasing entitlements, [instead] increasing enterprise. Not redistributing wealth, but reinvigorating and reenergizing our energy sector to create new work.... You've got a problem set that progressives like, but an answer that conservatives like."
- Whoever leads this sector, and develops pilots, as well as patterns, will get signed up for the next tough challenge. As cities face and push through these tougher challenges, leaders' commitment and dedication to the people can be a driver for others to make necessary changes.
- Cities need to start talking about these issues differently, and in a way that makes sense to ordinary citizens.
- What happened in the Gulf of Mexico should be a wake-up call. We can't do things the same way as we've been doing them.
- The climate bill [which Congress is considering] is not just about jobs, it's about making sure the energy workers in our country have more options. We need to put a price on the dirty stuff and let clean energy take off.
- The vision must be build while expectations are managed. But the issue can't be solved the "day after the speech." It's still within the first 14 months of having any federal dollars tied to green jobs. Any significant progress in green jobs will take more time. There are 750,000 green jobs right now, and that is a real number. But there must be a price on carbon for green jobs to really work, and minorities and the disadvantaged must get a fair shot at getting these jobs.

- Ben Hecht: Workforce systems generally are built on inputs that are disconnected from where the jobs are. Leaders must say that green jobs will be based on policies (there is a series of policies that could encourage green jobs). There are a lot of buildings to be retrofitted and someone has to do this work. If you intentionally marry the policies and the training programs and the jobs, you'll get this done.
- Once people see it happening, then they'll get on board.
- Kate Houston (Philadelphia): Expressed concern that there were fewer and fewer opportunities for entry-level workers. Van Jones pointed to California, which began to develop a pathway when the economy collapsed. He also said that in addition to the chronically poor, there were the new poor. But all of the work isn't done. Cities need to stand up and make sure that no one is sitting idle until the work is done.

Highlights & Insights from Team Huddle #1: "Getting to Work"

- Immediate reactions to the workshop design and team huddle exercise:
 - teams benefited from simply being in the same room together in a different setting;
 - teams learned about initiatives in their own city about which they didn't know;
 - a few teams met their team members for the first time at the workshop; and
 - some city teams made progress on identifying action steps.
- A common challenge that emerged from the team huddle report outs was how to better communicate about and market existing programs.
- Some persisting topics mentioned by the city teams were first-source hiring language/Community Workforce Agreements, asset mapping, career pathway mapping, highlighting the available supply chain for alternative manufacturing, investing in screening trainees for success, and collocating workforce system and one-stops at high schools and community colleges.

By City/Region:

- Atlanta said its goal was to conduct a green asset map.
- Chicago said that it already had the Chicago Climate Action Plan, Green Corps Chicago, and stimulus money. The city's challenges were the alignment of supply and demand for green jobs, and the effective communication of its successes.

- Columbus recognized that there needed to be greater communication and coordination among staff who worked on the City's sustainability, workforce development, and economic development programs. Columbus, like Atlanta, identified thought it was important to conduct an asset mapping exercise.
- Detroit: recognized that market demand and businesses must be in place to generate jobs.
- The District of Columbia faced five key challenges: how to move the green economy past the development community; how to move beyond stimulus money; how to better leverage the unique assets of DC; how to communicate DC's progressive policies better; and how to reintegrate disenfranchised people into the economy.
- East Bay talked about the hardest-to-serve population and how to help those people get jobs.
- El Paso indicated that its goal was to advance the green economy and overcome financing issues. The question they needed to answer was, "How do we create jobs along with opportunity?"
- Los Angeles: hoped to bring back skilled workers who can go anywhere after obtaining a marketable skills set.
- Miami discussed how to employ local residents while also building low-income housing. The team worked together to make a plan for a new energy retrofitting program.
- Milwaukee wanted to align workforce with opportunities and overcome challenges by increasing demand for retrofits and by preparing contractors to do the work.
- Philadelphia embraced the challenge of coordinating among the various entities that are managing federal grants for green jobs training. The team understood that better coordination would help the City make the most effective use of funding.
- Pittsburgh reviewed program and projects already underway and in the process better understood the work that various team members did. They recognized the need for more collaboration, communication and broad-based support.
- Sacramento wanted to engage the business community and access financing, create a partnership with the East Bay, better understand the roles of banks in the green economy, and fine-tune what the City is currently doing.

- Seattle discussed how to improve coordination among the organizations represented on the team; and how to spur market demand and synchronize it with job training.

“Growing Green Jobs & Business Opportunities in Our Cities: A Private-Sector Perspective,” Jigar Shah, GEO, Carbon War Room and founder of SunEdison

- Cities’ biggest challenge is getting private financing for energy efficiency. The challenge is that everyone is starting in the middle with the stimulus money.
- Cities need to look at advanced financing mechanisms, from property assessed clean energy bonds, to on-bill financing with utilities, to securitization of unsecured debt for these energy efficiency projects.
- An example from the district required a few years ago that any building above 200,000 sq feet had to do an energy audit (about 575 buildings in the district, or about 100 million sq. feet of property total). A low-end retrofit is about \$10/sq. foot, or in total about 1 billion dollars for just those 575 buildings. All of the energy waste in a city needs to be mined, not just the amount covered in a \$30-\$40M program; and the private sector needs to be involved.
- Cities must be careful about setting expectations. This effort is about starting something that will take a long time to implement. It will start small, but can grow quickly and will take hundreds of millions of dollars and it will involve thousands of jobs.
- Energy retrofitting can be done quicker with on-bill financing, but a lot of utilities don’t want to sell less product [i.e. energy]. So PACE allows cities to do retrofits without the utility. Then when the utility gets interested, cities can bring up on-bill payment mechanisms as an alternative to PACE.
- People are going into green jobs for a career, not a “green job.”
- Demand must come before the supply. You must prove that you can originate the loans in order to get the financing (as SunEdison did when it sold the product and made customers wait two years to get financing).
- It’s important not only to think of green jobs but also of green entrepreneurs. It matters that you have a one-stop shop in your city for these people to go to for information. Look at how you can streamline the cities procurement rules and be honest about timing with the green entrepreneurs in your city.

Theme: Explore and Inspire

Plenary Panel I: Integrated Approaches to Green Job Creation

Moderator: Matthew Mayrl, Policy Director, Apollo Alliance

Presenters: Joel Simon, Associate Vice President, CAEL: San Antonio's Green Jobs Program
Julie Sinai, Chief of Staff, Mayor's Office, City of Berkeley: East Bay Green Corridor's regional approach to green economic development and job creation

- The Apollo Alliance and Green for All developed a four step approach (2008) for creating green collar jobs: 1) planning, identifying goals and opportunities; 2) enacting policies that will drive demand and job opportunities; 3) preparing a skilled workforce; and 4) leveraging success to build political support (marshalling political will; examples include Los Angeles and Newark).
- There needs to be a balance between environmental goals and economic goals. Also be aware of the message you deliver because words and culture are important, and they influence the success of an initiative (i.e. communication matters).
- There is a distinction between green jobs and green skills. If a skills differential is really negligible, then there isn't room for a green training program (such as in a recycling program) to help meet that sustainability goal. Where green skills have an impact on business or the success of the public investment, workforce development and education and training can come into play.
- Asset mapping includes being realistic about the opportunities in your area (e.g. San Antonio), zooming in on your niche (good examples are East Bay and Sacramento), and really working with your employers to understand the nature of your workforce issues. Ask yourselves the question, "What is it, skills differential, certification, or a need for new jobs?"
- Mayoral office leadership may have made a difference to the tenor of conversation in the room, and certainly does in city efforts in terms of prioritizing collaboration across departments. A heightened sense of accountability can go hand in hand with strong mayoral leadership. Mayors can effectively put pressure on other mayors in regional efforts.
- In the absence of strong leadership, getting the right people across departments to work together is critical. Make sure that the group isn't too big either. One way to bridge the

special interests and community groups is through subcommittee outreach, not through direct participation in the decision-making bodies.

- Regional efforts help bring to light the reality of how contractors work and can also help raise visibility.
- Some ways in which regional green jobs efforts are operationalized include ‘second source’ requirements, extended enterprise zones, and coordinated green-tech academies with a single point of contact for curriculum development (e.g. a national lab).
- The purpose of the East Bay Green Corridor is green energy economic development in the region: workforce development, business development, and policy development combined. Workforce development is aligned with business development. Business development deals with cradle to scale, i.e. taking the R&D outputs of the national lab and the local university and commercializing them, and then keeping the associated firms in the East Bay. Business development is also working to retain and help small green businesses already in production go to scale.

Plenary Panel II: Engaging Business in Green Job Creation

Moderator: Laura Fisher, Senior Vice President, Allegheny Conference on Community Development

Presenters: Kurt Geiger, Head of Human Capital Management, North America, Gamesa
Chris Bevacqua, Commercial Manager, Government Relations, GE Corporate
Kristine Mazzei, Managing Partner, Valley Vision (Green Capital Alliance, Sacramento)
Tracey Nichols, Economic Development Director, City of Cleveland

- Start by looking for common occupations among many industries in order to prepare workers for jobs that are in the greatest demand, such as welders, quality-technicians, electricians, plumbers, millwrights, and carpenters. There is a need to help people understand how their occupational skills are transferable among multiple industries.
- Although skills for green jobs are not necessarily new (e.g. electricians) to the green economy, the products and sectors are changing. There are good employment opportunities along entire supply chains in sectors, such as wind power generation. For example, Gamesa’s supply chain includes some 105 companies in Pennsylvania, which manufacture parts for wind turbines.

- Job opportunities are now emerging as existing businesses expand and as European companies establish a presence in the United States to meet growing demand. Local chambers of commerce and cities can assist this expansion.
- Opportunities exist to partner with established community, four-year and trade and technical colleges. All stakeholders can get credit for the work, which is a selling-point for collaboration.
- Development of green job academies can help orient youth (secondary schools) toward careers in green industries.
- Role of cities - GE looks for leading cities where it can do business by looking at the following:
 - Climate plans, which are important because they send clear signals of municipal intent to the private sector; those with concrete actions and benchmarks offer greater certainty for business planning;
 - Energy retrofitting activity (commercial, residential, industrial): What are cities doing to promote retrofit agendas? Cities should be lobbying their states and making the connections with rebate programs at all levels (federal, state, and local). Cities must then communicate the information to property-owners so that they can easily finance their projects. GE has capital available to help support finance activities for retrofits.
 - Mayoral or city “challenge” programs – What kind, if any, have been initiated?
- Look to the internal capacity within your working group in order to solve the local problems (the Green Capital Alliance once brought in outside economists to help Sacramento with green economic development, only to realize that those already working in the area were better positioned to help the city).
- Cities need to “talk to the people who are actually in charge of the businesses.” Having conversations with the leaders of your business community can lead to new relationships and insights into what is possible for the local business community (e.g. Green Capital Alliance’s position as a neutral convener of the private and public sectors on economic development issues. The Alliance conducts CEO Roundtables with current local companies, which operate like focus groups.) Partner organizations can benefit from key findings of such discussions.
- Relationships and communication across departments even before opportunity strikes can pay off by encouraging faster and increased responsiveness.

- Design meetings well and have clear focus and vision to help city initiatives succeed. Make sure that there are benefits to participating in the meetings, such as high-level networking opportunities or time with political representatives.
- If you want to keep business at the table, every meeting, especially the first, has to add value.
- Cleveland's programs represent a varied approach to green economic development, which includes support for the Evergreen Co-Ops, and brownfield redevelopment. Economic development also includes efforts to help people with criminal records get jobs and on the job training.
- Get economic development people and industry involved early on in the discussion.
- Moving beyond ARRA will require local investments.

A city's economic development office can help create demand by working with potential employers on land acquisition and brownfield funding.

Remarks: Greg Nickels, Distinguished Urban Fellow at Living Cities, former Mayor of the City of Seattle and President of the U.S. Conference of Mayors

- Climate change is a local issue. In 2005-2006, Nickels took advantage of the momentum surrounding the Kyoto Protocol and challenged mayors from across the country. Seattle took the lead to grow the network of cities committing to GHG reductions. Cities are taking the lead in the United States: 1,030 mayors have now signed the U.S. Mayors Climate protection agreement, representing some 87 million Americans.
- Any international climate treaty will be a weak treaty, and that is okay because it will represent a human commitment. The real action must happen at the local/community/city level.
- Take the next step and get the right people at the table, like those at the CLA (representatives of sustainability, workforce development, finance, business, community colleges, etc.).

Keynote Address: “The Federal Role in Green Job Creation,” Jane Oates, Assistant Secretary of Employment & Training Administration, U.S. Department of Labor

- This has to be a grassroots movement to green everything. It won't happen if cities wait for federal money.
- There will be new green jobs, but there is also the greening of existing jobs.
- It has to start with the mayors. You must talk to employers to convince them to move into your urban area. There can't be a metropolitan hub without good jobs. And in the 21st Century, you can't have good jobs without green jobs. You have to have the infrastructure to attract companies and sustain them with a well-skilled green workforce and help them grow.
- DOL is now in the process of creating an advisory group for the Secretary comprised of utility companies to discuss future grant opportunities. The advisory group will be comprised of employers and unions and community-based groups.
- We need to look at our competitor countries, such as China and figure out why American companies are investing in green industries abroad and not in the United States.
- There was about \$700 million in Recovery Act funding. DOL will award \$100 million in grants. The next round will hopefully be more sophisticated because there are more green companies nationwide and competition will be more robust.
- Look at companies who are incubating these green industries and what they need/ want in order to be located in a city. Cities need to retrofit buildings to appeal to the clientele who want to be in a “green” building. Business won't wait, they will move to the next city.
- Make sure community colleges have the infrastructure financing they need to do green job training at a larger scale than just one student at a time.
- DOL understands that it won't be a cookie cutter approach. But they need feedback on how to let the more advanced cities (like Seattle) advance at the same time as the ones just starting out (such as Mobile, AL). Cities must give DOL feedback.
- Apprenticeship programs are a shining example of what's possible; DOL will support them.

- This summer DOL is starting conversations to identify the credentials that have power and value in the job marketplace.
- Alignment with other departments, such as Department of Education, will happen regardless of Congressional directive or not. DOL is providing technical support for the Workforce Investment Act (WIA). The DOL is hopeful that WIA will be passed in June. There will be hope if, as a community, we can get something passed and are able to move forward.
- There is about \$1 billion in the bill for summer jobs. The bill needs to get the necessary votes on House side to pass.
- Entrepreneurial training is doing more comprehensive training. It would be great to partner community college training with entrepreneurial training.
- In order to make the case for the low-skilled, low-income workers, cities need to put a face on the issue and raise awareness. Cities can make changes for the training programs to align with the needs of low-skilled, low-income workers. For example, make libraries a part of the economic development system, which is where a lot of low-income, low-skilled people go to search for jobs, type resumes, while all the while entertaining their children for free.

Concurrent session Round 1: Choose Your Challenge

Session 1: Working effectively with community colleges on energy efficiency training programs (Julian Alssid, Workforce Strategy Center)

Themes in addition to those in the Workforce Strategy Center report on community colleges:

- Dealing with the opportunity cost of attending training vs. working a low-paying job: LATTC provides compressed/accelerated training on evenings and weekends and distance trainings.
 - Question from a nonprofit trainer: “What do you do if community colleges see your program as competition?” Marcy Drummond recommended getting in touch with ‘workforce’ program administrators in colleges outside the service territory to help make connections and build relationships.

Session 2: Market analysis of demand and training program development (Joel Simon, CAEL)

- There is no commonly agreed-upon tool by which to measure the green economy. Some broad categories of jobs to be measured include:
 - Energy Generation and Distribution
 - Building Energy Efficiency
 - Transportation
 - Air and Water Quality
 - Environmental Education
 - Renewable Materials
 - Energy Efficient Manufacturing
 - Sustainable Food Production
- The *Greening of the World of Work: Implications for O*NET®-SOC and New and Emerging Occupations* report identified three categories of occupations that are shaped by the advances and expansion of the “green economy”
 - *Green increased demand occupations*: Existing occupations that will have an increasing number of openings because of the changes in the green economy;
 - *Green enhanced skills occupations*: Existing occupations whose work activities, educational requirements, and skills have been changed to meet the demands of the green economy;
 - *Green new and emerging occupations*: occupations with duties, knowledge and skills that are unique to the green economy.
- Survey tools are critical to capturing information on market demand, but must be applied frequently to capture rapidly shifting dynamics.
- The US Department of Labor has awarded grants to thirty states to developing labor market information tools, which will help gauge green job creation.

Session 3: Effective approaches to green skills training for low-income workers (Seth Green, Job Opportunity Investment Network, & Denise Fairchild, Emerald Cities Collaborative)

- Sector development strategies
 - Think of workforce development in terms of a pipeline that begins in elementary school extends through college, and ends in job placement in a particular sector.

- Explore multiple pathways in seeking to provide job opportunity to low income workers. Ask the question, “What is the value chain for a sector such as energy efficiency? In addition to construction, there is design, marketing, planning, and policy. This way, you may identify more opportunities and may be able to better match workers’ talents and interests with the available jobs.
- Improve foundational skills: initiative, problem-solving, integrity, in addition to reading, writing, and arithmetic.
- Successful use of contextualized learning in Philadelphia
 - Literacy Bridge Program integrates contextualized literacy and technical training, so that prospective workers acquire the requisite basic skills by using job-related materials. For the trainees, reading, writing, and arithmetic gain added relevance.
 - The approach makes it easier for trainees to complete the program because they get all the job skills they need in one place.
 - Cost ranges between \$4,000-\$5,000 per worker.
- Unions have a role to play in helping children understand the importance of education in finding good jobs as adults.

Session 4: Retooling manufacturing capacity for the green economy (Keith Cooley, NextEnergy & John Dybvig, Blue Green Alliance).

- Assume that retooling deals with both product lines as well as the manufacturing processes. Some new products and services may be possible, but all companies can green their operations.
- Some companies have adaptive capacity while others do not; some may want to gain adaptive capacity, while others may not be able to (e.g., drilling bit manufacturer may be able to shift into geothermal products).
- Find ways to support firms that are facing dislocations or downsizing of markets. Cities, for example, may be able to help such firms examine their desire and ability to expand or shift into new product lines or services.
- Find ways to help people look at options for working with others to form new local supply chains.

- Provide incentives to help companies that want to adapt to the changing economy. The decision to adapt can emanate from outside the company via persuasion, or inside the company at either the senior level or staff/floor level.
- When a firm decides to evolve, cities and their allies can help the firm learn how to access new contracts (e.g., necessary certifications, standards, contract requirements).

Session 5: Energy efficiency sector policy drivers for stimulating job creation (Stan Price, Northwest Energy Efficiency Council and Mandy Mahoney, City of Atlanta)

- Examples of key policies that have driven energy efficiency and related business and job creation in the Pacific Northwest include:
 - Northwest Power Act of 1982, which created the Bonneville Power Administration and prioritized energy efficiency. The Act “galvanized the utilities”;
 - The creation of a public purpose charge in Oregon, which led to the creation of the Energy Trust of Oregon, which funds energy efficiency and renewable energy projects;
 - A citizen’s initiative to create an energy efficiency portfolio standard in both Oregon and Washington;
 - Various climate policies, notably Seattle’s and state Climate Action Plans adopted in both WA and OR;
 - A new energy performance disclosure requirement for commercial and multifamily buildings by the City of Seattle;
 - A \$505 million bond measure in Washington that would raise \$2 billion in grants to schools for energy efficiency improvements. The measure would create 30,000 jobs in the skilled trades. The measure is up for public vote.
 - These and other policy initiatives have created an excellent business climate for energy efficiency in Washington and Oregon.
- Georgia doesn’t enjoy the same level of political support for energy efficiency as does Washington. As a result, Atlanta is starting small, with things the City can directly control. For instance, the City is setting its own energy efficiency and greenhouse gas reduction targets, and financing energy efficiency retrofits of its own buildings. Atlanta is also seeding projects (“angel investors” model), and trying to figure out how to work

better with the local utilities. Atlanta is also using EECBG funds to finance a PACE program, and got PACE legislation passed by hiring a Republican lobbyist and casting the measure as a jobs bill.

- The Merton Rule is used in some cities (as in London) and requires that a certain percentage of the energy needed by new development projects must come from renewable energy.
- Berkeley has a voluntary program that saves three years on average. The “green pathway” program offers expedited permits for developers agreeing to a host of sustainability measures, including energy efficiency, no new net run-off, LEED Gold, local hiring, etc. (Los Angeles also has a similar expedited permit program.)
- There are also programs that reimburse developers for US Green Building Council registration fees if they achieve LEED certification (as in Columbus).
- The 2006 Green Building Act requires LEED Silver certification for all public and publicly funded buildings in the District of Columbia. DC is now working on a point-of-sale requirement for residential dwellings. The District created a sustainable energy utility using a public benefits charge. The District also requires commercial buildings to benchmark against Energy Star and to disclose energy performance information.
- Cities often face communications challenges around energy efficiency policies. So it is critical to have a credible messenger, such as Economic Development director announce a new program on building energy efficiency retrofitting.

Session 6: Workforce development strategies in the absence of strong labor demand (Dave Trovato, Seattle Jobs Initiative)

- Workforce development systems need to adjust to trends in green job opportunities by collaborating closely with employers, using all possible sources of market information, and tailoring job training based on employer feedback (as in Seattle).
- Federal and state funding entities should broaden their definition of “green jobs” to allow workforce development programs to address a wider array of jobs and skills.
- Workforce development organizations should fund small-scale training and placement pilots, and prepare to scale up quickly when demand begins to rise.

- In the short-term, workforce development programs may need to concentrate on improving the skills of workers who are already employed, rather than serve unemployed workers. Most workforce grants, however, don't permit this strategy.
- Given the current uncertainty about the economy, workforce funding could be directed at longer term investments, such as state of the art training facilities (as in Richmond, CA).
- DOL should require states to develop stable standards and certifications for training programs.
 - But certifications can discourage hiring, especially during a recession. In the near term, workforce programs should create career pathways that could lead to credentials.
 - Trade associations should get involved in the certification issue (as in Seattle)
- DOL should consider new grant requirements that focus less on demonstrating placement outcomes and more on encouraging collaboration across organizations to achieve comprehensive workforce development. Los Angeles has built broad based collaboration across workforce organizations. Funders measure success with a range of performance metrics tied to principles of good workforce development.
- More training is needed for case managers and staff in One-Stop centers; they need the skills to stay constantly apprised of a dynamic market for green products and services and the associated employment opportunities.

Plenary Panel III: Opportunities for All: Policies, programs and partnerships to help disadvantaged workers

Moderator: Jeremy Hays, Director of Special Projects, Green for All

Presenters: Sal Vaca, Director, RichmondWORKS: training and job placement
 Marcy Drummond, Vice President of Workforce Education and Economic Development, Los Angeles Trade-Technical College: creating career pathways

- Everyone in the community needs to have a stake in making the green economy work, including low-income and disenfranchised people.
- In Richmond, California, a new city policy goal of reducing violence in the community prompted a broad based collaboration across economic development and workforce organizations to create green jobs for low income people, especially those formerly incarcerated.

- Richmond’s policy helped trigger action on equity. This occurred because the City Council directed every department to include a line item for reducing violence and investing in youth.
- Richmond has achieved high rates of placement for low-income graduates of green jobs training programs. Keys to success include:
 - Robust local hiring policies (first source local hiring) that require businesses building city-funded projects to hire local residents (and the city’s unapologetic approach to implementing them);
 - Workforce Development is aligned with contract compliance and are both under one department within the city;
 - Hiring requirements built directly into RFPs and construction contracts;
 - Efforts to connect project bidders with organizations that are training low-income people (e.g. the workforce organization Richmond Works), which enables Richmond Works to help businesses comply with the hiring policies;
 - MOUs between Richmond Works and specific city departments specifying hiring goals;
 - Efforts to remove or suspend policies that act as barriers – e.g. policies requiring that city employees have a certain amount of work experience;
 - Labor unions helped the city develop the first-source hiring agreements; and
 - The ability to use ARRA funds as an incentive for contractors to make local hiring commitments.
- In Los Angeles, LATTC has collaborated closely with the City to design a comprehensive workforce system for the utility sector. Core elements include:
 - A thorough analysis of market trends through review of labor market data, current demand-driving policies and consultation with employers;
 - Identification of the most promising green occupations;
 - Review of hiring barriers;
 - An inventory of existing training institutions and offerings to identify gaps;
 - Development of skills maps; and
 - Creation of career pathways by creating “stackable certified programs leading to degrees.”
- A few lessons from LATTC’s work include:
 - Prep courses help prepare students with basic cross-over skills and allow for accelerated degree programs.

- Contextualized training gives participants an opportunity to practice skills, but also teaches the traditional math and English skills so that students can pass the tests.
- Organizing cohorts of students based on similar abilities and needs allows LATTC to customize training offerings and helps students succeed.

Highlights & Insights from Day 2 by city

- Philadelphia team discussed how to link economic development and workforce development.
- Detroit team discussed developing an infrastructure, identifying resources, conducting a gap analysis and identifying a champion for green job creation.
- Los Angeles focused on accomplishing municipal green jobs with the help of the Department of Water and Power.
- Columbus discussed asset mapping, connecting people to get things done, finding Columbus' niche and figuring out how to get policies in place.
- Atlanta set a set of action items: conduct a baseline analysis and asset mapping; inventory existing green jobs; identify existing training programs; and conduct policy analysis.
- In the East Bay, RichmondWORKS offered to run a new small pilot green jobs program.
- El Paso discussed how to keep jobs created in the recovery act viable. The goal was to help create jobs in the implementation of the City's Climate Action Plan.
- Miami expressed appreciation for its participation in the workshop and the opportunity to learn from the other cities.
- Cleveland discussed how to bring green energy efficiency to scale and talked with Emerald Cities about how ECC could help Cleveland.
- Pittsburgh talked about how to build public awareness and support for the green economy, creating a common messaging strategy, creating a corporate call to action, and having all of the hospitals go green.
- Seattle discussed financing and bonding authorities and the idea from RichmondWORKS to have a local hiring agreement.

Theme: Strategize and Commit

Plenary Panel IV: Leadership: The Role of Cities in the Green Economy

City Team Presentations:

Larry Frank, Deputy Mayor of Neighborhood and Community Services, City of Los Angeles, LA Workforce Systems Collaborative

Myra Edwards, Liaison on Workforce Development, Office of the Mayor, City of Milwaukee: Municipal and regional leadership strategies

- Mayors can broker good ideas, bring people together, broker financing, enforce and influence.
- Los Angeles created a Workforce Systems Collaborative: a process that linked and coordinated city policy, workforce development, and employers. The process included: identifying the sectors that the City would focus on (7 sectors total); building sector-based job training programs; identifying sector intermediaries and funding that could support them; having conversations about systems integration and co-location of training and workforce development within community colleges and high schools; supporting a bond measure to build a campus (Innovation Campus) to house the programs.
- Build-up trust and divide responsibilities among partners. Leverage tools and resources as well as public sector hiring (as in LA).
- Friendly competition between cities can spur activity (e.g. LA vs. NY summer job comparison).
- Attracting business sometimes means putting very simple policies in place to ensure predictability, like LA's 7-day turnaround on requests to install an electric vehicle outlet.
- Small and existing businesses need working capital and advances in order to expand and hire more people. Federal programs don't support small businesses in this way. Cities can push for more working capital to help small businesses expand and hire trained workers. (Florida's carpenters union is using its pension to create its own bank to finance green programs/projects with the caveat that companies will hire people that complete the union's training programs.)

- Having an institutionalized vision with specific goals, for which players are accountable, sends a clear signal to industry, job training providers, and educators. The city's role is then to help align the interests of the various stakeholders and help coordinate their efforts.
- Chicago's I's: be *inclusive*, *institutionalize* across departments, and *incentivize* the private sector. Mayors can focus all of the various city departments that play a part in green job creation and help staff understand the interconnections. Cities can incentivize the private sector in ways that really matter, including pushing the procurement process, small business financing and supply chain to be more localized and cognizant of what green jobs mean. And cities can promote inclusion by engaging a wide array of stakeholders, including unions, and communicate with the public, so that consumers can ultimately drive the demand for green jobs.
- Cities can create simple, predictable policies to attract business (LA electric car example).
- Cities can promote systems integration (as in Berkeley with integration of workforce development, education curriculum, and career pathways). Cities can be instrumental in bringing the appropriate people to the table, including industries, educational providers, and nonprofits.
- Former Mayor Greg Nickels said, "every city has a role to play, because there are many different types of cities and so each can inspire those more like them" (e.g. the 'Seattles').
- Summary: there are four areas where city leadership can play a role, 1) developing a vision and message, and publicizing and communicating; 2) bringing stakeholders together, having a neutral role, and identifying and developing stakeholders and having the power to keep them there; 3) developing policy and funding, brokering, institutionalizing work, performance management and accountability; and 4) organizing consumers and individuals in a partnership.

Concurrent session Round 2: Choose Your Challenge

Session 1: Policy tools for linking job creation, opportunity, and the sustainability agenda, including discussion of Community Workforce Agreements (Jeremy Hays, Green for All)

- The goal of a Community Workforce Agreement is to ensure that expected new jobs are high quality, living wage jobs with connections to career pathways. Portland's CWA is also designed to ensure that people throughout Portland, especially those from low-

income and minority communities, historically under-represented in the workforce, can land these good jobs.

- Even when CWA's aren't legally binding, a city can pass a resolution (like in Portland) formalizing the City's commitment to the agreement's provisions and directing city agencies to support its implementation. Portland's ordinance also establishes a Stakeholder Evaluation and Implementation Committee to ensure continued community involvement in monitoring implementation and making recommendations for improvements. It also ties the provisions of the CWA to the goals outlined in Portland's draft Climate Action Plan, Regional Equity Atlas, and five-year Economic Development Strategy.
- Another strategy is to limit the term of the agreement to the duration of the pilot program, while sending out a clear signal that stakeholders would be invited to help develop a new and better version for the scaled up program envisioned for the future. This method takes some of the pressure off getting the CWA perfect the first time.
- Keys to Success:
 - Develop an inclusive process with trusted facilitation.
 - Present a clear timeframe.
 - Ensure that the right people have a seat-at-the-table.
 - Create ownership through follow-on activities.
- The Community Workforce Agreement (CWA) demonstrates that it is possible to build a community-wide vision – even among groups that often disagree – on a set of concrete goals and standards for ensuring that retrofitting jobs provide good pay and benefits and are accessible to all. It can also include standards for training and mentoring programs, including those which include minority and underrepresented groups.
- One of the most innovative elements of Portland's Community Workforce Agreement is the creation of a **best value contracting** method for determining which businesses will be invited to join the program's approved contractor pool. The City and the Oregon Energy Trust have committed to evaluating a broad set of attributes that collectively reveal what kinds of jobs and benefits the contractors offer and how they tend to conduct hiring.
- Stakeholders can be active in the implementation phase through a Stakeholder Evaluation and Implementation Committee and its sub-committees. Members can assess how the agreement is working, review whether the "best value contracting" approach to

contractor pool selection is resulting in higher quality jobs and better job access, and recommend improvements for the agreement's next iteration. Beyond creating accountability, this inclusionary approach strengthens relationships between stakeholders and the City, and builds trust among the stakeholder groups themselves.

Session 2: Cultivating new green economic sectors, including renewable energy and storm water management (Tamara Jones, Southface Energy Institute and Kate Houstoun, Sustainable Business Network)

- In Philadelphia, key drivers for making stormwater management a targeted sector for green job development were:
 - EPA's increased regulation of stormwater pollution and combined sewer overflows;
 - A bold city commitment to convert 1/3 of the city's impervious surface to green stormwater infrastructure and policy changes requiring property owners to pay for stormwater management based on the extent of their impervious surface; and
 - Funding support from EPA, and new financing packages that will assist commercial property owners with investments in green infrastructure.
- In Philadelphia, the Sustainable Business Network of Greater Philadelphia, a non-profit organization, is helping realize the green job potential in this new sector by organizing industry panels. Industry panels can help employers network, pool training resources and assess and grow local supply chains.
- Cities need to increase support for companies that are trying to get new products into the marketplace. But how can cities retain the start-ups that receive assistance through incubators and city incentives? Atlanta saw one major solar start up relocate its manufacturing operations to another city as soon as it was ready to expand.
- When expanding companies decide to relocate manufacturing operations, cities need to evaluate whether retaining the corporate headquarters is enough. Corporate headquarters usually do not generate a significant number of green jobs and the employees often live outside the city, reducing multiplier effects. Cities like Chicago are trying to develop more robust strategies for growing manufacturing jobs.
- Cleveland strongly supports worker cooperatives as a strategy for growing green jobs that can be retained in the long-term (The Mayor says they create "sticky capital" because their owners have a strong sense of place).

- Cities sometimes overestimate the importance of financial incentives. One key to attracting and retaining young green businesses is ensuring an adequate supply of green sites, green facilities (e.g. LEED-certified) and other amenities like bike paths.
- A community-by-community assessment to examine energy needs and energy consumption patterns is one way to identify opportunities for reducing energy use while creating green jobs. Wisconsin undertook such a process.
- Supply chain analysis is critical for identifying business gaps and opportunities to create green jobs.

Session 3: Dealing with the certification issue (Joel Simon, CAEL)

- Certification is a proxy for trust. Certifications indicate a level of quality that the user cannot and will not independently verify.
- As the demand for workers increases new training providers will need to be engaged. Independent standards and certification attainment rates will be the best measure of the validity and quality of training and training organizations.
- Certification is the verification of standards. If the standards are not valued, then the certification will not be either.
- Buildings can be certified, organizations can be certified, people (skills) can be certified, and processes can be certified. Make sure that the measurement and validation tool is measuring and validating the correct thing.
- Certifications that are legitimate may or may not be in used by the market.
- Public funding can help promote certifications generally (that some standards must be applied, measured and verified) or specifically (that particular standards must be met). By linking standards and certification to publicly-funded work, cities can help institutionalize use of standards and certifications in their communities.

Session 4: Mapping Career Pathways (Marcy Drummond, LATTTC)

- The key is to start by identifying priority sectors, then do career mapping for those. LATTTC has a pretty sophisticated way of doing this, including tracking policy bodies, using economic development models, etc.
- Next, work closely with the business sector(s) to both pick the sectors of promise and create the career maps (identify skills, training programs, certification

needs/opportunities, etc.) LATTC has a standing business collaborative for the following sectors: solar, weatherization, HVAC, clean fuels, water, and deconstruction.

- LATTC has used a variety of software programs and data sets, including MindJet, ONET, DACUM facilitator, and EMSI.
- If the data is readily available, LATTC can do a career pathway map in a month; otherwise (more typical) it can take a lot longer.

Session 5: Strategies for cultivating new small green business (Ben Siegel, Center for Faith-based and Neighborhood Partnerships, US Department of Labor and formerly with SEEDCO)

- SEEDCO's roundtables with contractors found that 1) either didn't know or were misinformed about relevant public policies and incentives; 2) needed access to working capital; and 3) were more interested in employees with soft skills (e.g. communication) rather than the technical skills, which job training programs provided.
- To address these findings, SEEDCO used its status as a Community Development Financial Institution to provide wage subsidies, using ARRA funding and meeting the Davis-Bacon ARRA wage level requirements. SEEDCO also worked with Goldman Sachs to develop a new small business loan product for energy efficiency contractors. SEEDCO also developed a technical assistance program for debt financing and project management.
- Atlanta is working with small minority-owned banks to create loan products for small businesses.
- Atlanta's initiative to get to zero waste is creating a small green business opportunity.
- Cleveland is looking to build the capacity of minority-owned businesses by keeping them informed about upcoming projects and the associated eligibility requirements.
- Cleveland is working on how to bring the Evergreen co-ops to scale. Increasing market demand represents the central challenge.

Session 6: City-union partnerships in the green economy (Miguel Fuentes, Political Director, Florida Carpenters Regional Council)

- Put aside assumptions about what is possible and the roles of various players.

- Cities and labor unions should look for common needs. Ask the questions, “what is the opportunity?” and, “how can working together lead to a win-win-win for labor-government-business?”
- Miami’s workforce development program offers a tangible example of how to work with labor unions and cities to bring young and disenfranchised people into the green economy.
- City hiring practices for public works projects can create demand for newly-trained workers.
- A successful program might have some of these characteristics:
 - Stipend for youth to participate;
 - Multi-week intensive training, peer support, and mentoring program;
 - A graduation toolkit (e.g. Miami program provides full complement of necessary carpentry tools upon completion of the pre-apprenticeship).
 - Criminal background check (depends on populations to be served) and drug testing.
 - May offer English as second language (ESL) training or other remedial skills training.
- Cities need to know the existing culture of all relevant labor groups, especially when new work bring into contact organizations with different organizational cultures.
- Trades will help support new initiatives if they see job potential for their members.
- Local governments can provide leadership in establishing a stakeholder process, help resolve differences and align interests, provide rewards and penalties through policy, assist with fund raising, and forge local-hire agreements.

Pulling it All Together: Closing Plenary Session

- Atlanta, GA
 - Implement the promising practices that the CLA identified.
- Chicago, IL
 - Restore the focus on the green economy and green jobs dimensions of the Climate Action Plan. Help the staff, who have been concentrating on the details of implementation, to understand that workforce development must be a central to our efforts and part of how we communicate about the Plan to the public.

- Take up the challenge of retooling and restructuring our economy in ways that don't simply repair its defects, but transform it into the green economy.
- Cleveland, OH
 - Work with the Ohio Solar Cooperative to develop new financing strategies for the Evergreen Cooperatives and the Evergreen Cooperative Fund.
 - Identify new ways to increase demand for energy efficiency outside the residential market, by focusing on the commercial market and utilities.
- Columbus, OH
 - Need to go through the exercise of asset mapping: an inventory of green jobs resources and activities in the city. This mapping will then form the foundation for our green jobs strategy, including workforce development.
 - Explore the possibility of creating a community benefits agreement or a community workforce agreement, to ensure that green jobs are, in fact, high-road jobs.
- Detroit, MI
 - Explore the developing community workforce agreements in Detroit's weatherization and new green economy initiatives.
 - Identify and support a high-level champion of the green economy in Detroit.
- District of Columbia
 - Explore the use of a community workforce agreement in the District.
 - Use the career mapping approach developed by the Los Angeles Trade-Technical College.
 - Emphasize the link between climate action planning and green jobs.
 - Advance the District's PACE program and combine it with a point-of-sale policy, which would encourage property-owners to use PACE.
- East Bay
 - Restructure the Rising Sun Energy Center's job training program to involve private industry from the recruitment phase all the way through to job placement. Use the private industry's assessment models from the beginning of the job training process.
 - Work with the East Bay Green Corridor partners to ensure that efforts move in the same direction and are better coordinated.

- El Paso, TX
 - Change the way we talk about the environmental programs so as to emphasize their potential for creating jobs and saving people money.
 - Explore the use of first-source hiring agreements and project labor agreements in El Paso.
- Los Angeles, CA
 - Use U.S. Department of Labor (OJT) funding to scale-up the training of workers, who will work on efficiency at the Los Angeles Department of Water & Power (DWP).
 - Support the addition of new contracted positions in the next DWP budget to restore the department's capacity to manage the new job training program.
- Miami, FL
 - Reframe and reenergize the city's sustainability efforts by focusing on green jobs. Use the examples of the other cities that took part in the CLA to engage public officials about ways to create jobs and reduce unemployment.
 - Create a green jobs committee among Miami's CLA team members to sustain the collaboration that we've begun here.
- Milwaukee, WI
 - Explore ways to get large banks and pension funds to invest in energy efficiency projects that create green jobs. Identify the right stakeholders that must work together on financing.
- Philadelphia, PA
 - Research the supply chains of particular sectors to identify new opportunities for green job creation.
 - Conduct a demonstration project on job creation associated with construction and demolition waste recovery. The city will recruit an organization that can demonstrate that recovering this material can be done on a cost-neutral basis.
 - Conduct feasibility studies of on-bill financing of energy retrofitting and point-of-sale reporting for large buildings.
- Pittsburgh, PA
 - Plan a summit that brings together all of the key stakeholders involved in green job creation in the city, with the goal of building a strategy for building a green economy and creating green jobs.

- Seek the support of the Mayor's office in green jobs efforts.
- Work with the leadership of the Allegheny Conference on Community Development to understand its regional strategy for workforce development, and seek ways to support and communicate the strategy to city residents.
- Sacramento, CA
 - Host a summit of the area's sustainability and economic development directors to ensure that environmental programs and job creation initiatives reinforce each other.
- Seattle, WI
 - Connect with colleagues in the East Bay Green Corridor and Los Angeles to learn more about how first source hiring agreements can be used to generate not only new green jobs, but jobs associated with all city contracts.